Experimental Assessment of Entropy Production in a Continuously Measured Mechanical Resonator

Massimiliano Rossi,1,2 Luca Mancino,3 Gabriel T. Landi,4 Mauro Paternostro,3 Albert Schliesser,1,2 and Alessio Belenchia3,*

1Niels Bohr Institute, University of Copenhagen, 2100 Copenhagen, Denmark
2Center for Hybrid Quantum Networks (Hy-Q), Niels Bohr Institute, University of Copenhagen, 2100 Copenhagen, Denmark
3Centre for Theoretical Atomic, Molecular, and Optical Physics, School of Mathematics and Physics, Queens University, Belfast BT7 1NN, United Kingdom
4Instituto de Física, Universidade de São Paulo, CEP 05314-970 São Paulo, Brazil

(Received 15 May 2020; accepted 23 July 2020; published 19 August 2020)

The information on a quantum process acquired through measurements plays a crucial role in the determination of its nonequilibrium thermodynamic properties. We report on the experimental inference of the stochastic entropy production rate for a continuously monitored mesoscopic quantum system. We consider an optomechanical system subjected to continuous displacement Gaussian measurements and characterize the entropy production rate of the individual trajectories followed by the system in its stochastic dynamics, employing a phase-space description in terms of the Wigner entropy. Owing to the specific regime of our experiment, we are able to single out the informational contribution to the entropy production arising from conditioning the state on the measurement outcomes. Our experiment embodies a significant step towards the demonstration of full-scale control of fundamental thermodynamic processes at the mesoscopic quantum scale.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.125.080601

The fundamental connections between information and thermodynamics dates back to the seminal contributions by Maxwell, Szilard, and Landauer [1]. The process of acquiring information can impact the entropic balance of a given physical process. Such information must thus be accounted for when formulating the second law, and considered on equal footing to other thermodynamic quantities, such as heat and work. This is particularly relevant for processes involving microscopic systems, which are fundamentally dominated by fluctuations: the acquisition of information through measurements introduces additional stochasticity and makes the overall process strongly dependent on the monitoring methodology.

Let us briefly illustrate the building blocks of the formulation of thermodynamics at the stochastic level. The changes $dS$ in the entropy of a system subjected to a process can be attributed both to a flow of entropy $\phi$ between the system and its surroundings and to a contribution $\pi$ associated to the irreversible production of entropy [2]. We can thus write

$$dS = \phi + \pi,$$

where both $\phi$ and $\pi$ are stochastic quantities that fluctuate with each repetition of the experiment. Averaging over many realizations yields the entropy flux and production rates, $\Phi$ and $\Pi$, respectively. The second law enforces $\Pi \geq 0$ with $\Pi = 0$ when the system is in equilibrium. The introduction of measurement and feedback processes profoundly affects the above statements, as it has been studied in both classical [3–7] and quantum contexts [6,8–10]. Experimental assessments of such modifications have been reported recently in a variety of systems, including classical Brownian particles [11], superconducting qubits [12,13], trapped ions [14,15], and nuclear magnetic resonance [16,17]. Frameworks for describing the dynamics of continuously monitored quantum systems have been developed [18–22] and fundamental fluctuation theorems involving heat, work, and entropy for continuously monitored quantum two-level systems have been studied [23–26], including assessments at the single-trajectory level [27,28].

When assessing a monitored system, one must distinguish between the unconditional evolution and the dynamics conditioned on the measurement records [6,9,29]. It can be shown that the average entropy flux rate of the conditional dynamics $\Phi_c$ equals the unconditional one $\Phi_{uc}$ [30]. However, the same is not true for the entropy production rate that governs the irreversibility of the process.

Acquiring information can only make the process more reversible, so that the average entropy production $\int \Pi_c d\tau$ of the conditional trajectories will be smaller than that of the unconditional one $\int \Pi_{uc} d\tau$. Their difference is precisely associated with an information-theoretic term and can be written as [7,29,30]

$$\Pi_c = \Pi_{uc} + \tilde{Z}.$$
where \( \dot{I} \) is the net rate at which information is acquired through measurement. This term thus captures the fundamental effect of the measurement, providing a valuable link between information and thermodynamics.

Despite its importance, thus far there has been no experimental assessment of the influence of such information theoretic contribution, arising from quantum measurements, to the entropy production. In this Letter, we fill such a gap by reporting the experimental observations of the impact of weak continuous measurements on the nonequilibrium thermodynamics of a mesoscopic mechanical resonator [31]. Our system consists of a nanomechanical resonator coupled to an optical cavity and exposed to the effects of both electromagnetic and phononic environments. We continuously monitor its position by means of homodyne measurements on the output optical field [31]. Combining the phase-space formalism laid down in Ref. [30] with state retrodiction methods [31], we are able to characterize the entropy production at the level of individual quantum trajectories. It should be noted that, in the phase-space formalism, we chose the Wigner entropy as the entropic measure which, despite its limitations to Gaussian dynamics, presents several advantages when considering nonstandard thermodynamics setups [32] (see the discussion in the following). Remarkably, we are able to single out precisely the contribution of the measurement influence to the entropy production.

Our experiment probes both the relaxation dynamics and the steady state. The latter, in particular, configures an informational steady state, where information acquired from the measurement is constantly counterbalancing noise introduced by the environment. In addition to the net rate of information gain \( \dot{I} \), we are also able to single out the differential information gain \( G(t) \), which represents the rate at which information must be acquired in each small time step in order to maintain this steady state. Our work thus embodies a step forward towards the full characterization of quantum mesoscopic irreversibility and its control via suitably arranged measurements.

**Experimental setup.**—The experimental system is provided by an ultracoherent soft-clamped membrane resonator [cf. inset of Fig. 1]. The central defect, embedded in a phononic crystal, supports a localized, “soft-clamped” mechanical mode [33] at the resonance frequency \( \Omega_m/(2\pi) = 1.14 \text{ MHz} \). Once cooled to a temperature of \( T = 11 \text{ K} \), we find for this mode a quality factor \( Q = \Omega_m/\Gamma_m = 1.03 \times 10^6 \), where \( \Gamma_m \) is the energy dissipation rate. The mechanical system is dispersively coupled to the frequency of a Fabry-Perot cavity mode (linewidth \( \kappa/(2\pi) = 18.5 \text{ MHz} \)), with vacuum optomechanical coupling rate \( g_0/(2\pi) = 129 \text{ Hz} \). The cavity mode is pumped by an external probe laser to an averaged photon occupancy \( \bar{n}_{\text{cav}} \). We assume that the semiclassical steady state of the nonlinear dynamics has been reached and, when speaking of different modes, we refer to the fluctuations around such a mean steady state, as it is common practice [34]. In this linearized interaction regime, the effective, multiphoton optomechanical coupling, enhanced by the average cavity photon occupancy, is \( \gamma = g_0 \sqrt{\bar{n}_{\text{cav}}} \) and the fluctuations of the system evolve according to a Hamiltonian that is quadratic in the system’s fluctuations. This ensures that all the states remain Gaussian.

We use an auxiliary light field to stabilize the system and provide precoupling of other mechanical modes. Such beam also introduces additional damping and cooling on the mode of interest, effectively changing its thermal environment. In addition, any small detuning of the probe beam from the cavity resonance causes additional damping. We account for these effects by introducing the effective energy damping rate and bath occupancy \( \Gamma_m/(2\pi) = 19 \text{ Hz} \) and \( \bar{n}_{\text{th}} = 14 \), respectively. The total thermal decoherence rate is thus \( \gamma = \Gamma_m(\bar{n}_{\text{th}} + 1/2) = 2\pi \times 265 \text{ Hz} \).

The quantum measurement is performed by imprinting, through the optomechanical interaction, the mechanical displacement in the phase quadrature of the probe laser. Such quadrature is measured by a phase-sensitive measurement of the output field, implemented using a balanced homodyne receiver with detection efficiency \( \eta_{\text{det}} = 74\% \) [cf. inset of Fig. 1].

Our experiment operates in the nonresolved-sideband regime \( \Omega_m \ll \kappa \), which enforces a separation of time scales and allows the cavity mode to be adiabatically eliminated [31]. In a frame rotating at frequency \( \Omega_m \) and within the rotating wave approximation, the conditional dynamics of the mechanical mode alone is well described by the stochastic master equation (SME) [35,36].

![FIG. 1. Conditional mechanical evolution. Measured conditional variance \( V(t) \) (blue line), from the initial unconditional value \( V_\infty \approx 34 \) to the steady state \( V_\infty \approx 0.8 \). The dashed line is a theoretical prediction. The inset shows a sketch of the experimental system, which comprises a cryogenic optomechanical cavity resonantly driven by a coherent probe laser. The mechanical resonator is in thermal contact with two baths: a thermal, cryogenic bath and the optical bath. The output field is continuously monitored by means of a homodyne receiver. The photocurrent \( i \) is used to estimate the conditional mechanical state.](image-url)
quantum measurement backaction is described by Eq. (3), on the other hand, has both first measurement outcomes. The conditional dynamics thus lead to a conditional steady-state density matrix with a higher purity than the unconditional one [45,46]. This is an instance of measurement-based cooling and was experimentally demonstrated in Ref. [31].

The unconditional Gaussian steady-state density matrix is characterized by vanishing first cumulants, \( \rho_{uc} = \langle \hat{X}_{uc} \rangle = \langle \hat{Y}_{uc} \rangle = 0 \), and a diagonal covariance matrix with elements \( V_{uc} = \langle \hat{X}^2 \rangle_{uc} = \langle \hat{Y}^2 \rangle_{uc} = \bar{n}_{th} + 1/2 + \Gamma_{qba}/\Gamma_m \). We use such state density matrix as the initial preparation in all experiments reported below. This is the natural steady state of the optomechanical system, thus its preparation requires only to wait for the initial brief transient to decay, before conditioning upon the measurement outcomes. The conditional dynamics described by Eq. (3), on the other hand, has both first and second cumulants evolving nontrivially according to

\[
\frac{d\rho_c}{dt} = (L_{th} + L_{qba} + L_{stoc})\rho_c dt. \tag{3}
\]

The last term in Eq. (5) can be neglected. The ensuing dynamics gives the covariance \( V(t) = V(t) \) where we have introduced the identity matrix \( \mathbb{1} \) and the c-number variance \( V(t) = \langle \hat{X}^2 \rangle - \langle \hat{X} \rangle^2 = \langle \hat{Y}^2 \rangle - \langle \hat{Y} \rangle^2 \). The first cumulants thus evolve stochastically, while the second ones obey a deterministic nonlinear evolution. It should be noted that, the process entailed by this model is dynamically stable, as it can be easily verified following the criteria discussed in Ref. [44]. This ensures the convergence of any quantity integrated over long-time windows.

The last term in Eq. (6) is associated with the information acquired by the measurement, and we dub it innovation. It is nonpositive as acquired information can never increase the uncertainty about the mechanical motion. According to Eq. (6), the initial unconditional variance \( V_{uc} \) evolves into the conditional steady-state value \( V_{ss} = -\mu + \sqrt{\mu(\mu + 2V_{uc})} \) with \( \mu = \Gamma_m/(8\eta_{det}\Gamma_{qba}) \). Owing to the innovation term, \( V_{ss} \leq V_{uc} \) given that \( \mu > 0 \). The continuous weak measurements thus lead to a conditional steady-state density matrix with a higher purity than the unconditional one [45,46]. This is an instance of measurement-based cooling and was experimentally demonstrated in Ref. [31].

The conditional variance \( V(t) \), however, evolves independently of the specific measurement outcomes. To assesses it experimentally we thus employ a prediction-retrodict method [31], which reconstructs \( V(t) \) by combining data on \( r(t') \) acquired at earlier \( t' < t \) and later times \( t' > t \). Such future outcomes can be used to obtain a retrodicted trajectory, \( r_s(t) \), [47] using an experimental filter similar to what has been derived from \( r(t) \) [37]. The fluctuations of the difference \( d(t) = r(t) - r_s(t) \) over an ensemble of independent realizations can be shown to be directly connected to \( V(t) \) according to the relation [37]

\[
V_d(t) = V(t) + V_{ss} + \Gamma_m/[4\eta_{det}\Gamma_{qba}]. \tag{7}
\]

In the limit of high cooperativity \( \Gamma_{qba} \gg \Gamma_m \) and large detection efficiency \( \eta_{det} \approx 1 \) the last term can be neglected. The values of \( V_{ss} \) and \( V(t) \) are then readily obtained as \( V_{ss} = V_d(\infty)/2 \) [31] and \( V(t) = V_d(t) - V_{ss} \), respectively.

Figure 1 shows the evolution of \( V(t) \) from the initial unconditional value \( V_{uc} \), all the way to the steady-state value \( V_{ss} \). The experimental data compare very well to the theoretical prediction provided by Eq. (6), thus strongly corroborating the suitability of our model.

**Entropy production along individual trajectories.** —We are now in a position to assess the thermodynamics of the system at the level of individual quantum trajectories. Our setup is not a standard thermodynamic system due to the presence of the optical cavity, which acts as a nonthermal bath. The usual formulation of entropy production thus does not apply. Despite this, it is possible to employ an alternative put forth in Ref. [32], which makes use of quantum phase-space methods and is adequate for the description of Gaussian dynamics. This approach has already been successfully applied to the experimental characterization of the mean entropy production in the dynamics of open mesoscopic systems [48]. In Ref. [30], the method was extended to account for the presence of quantum-limited detectors continuously monitoring the system.

When applied to our experimental endeavors [37], such theoretical framework shows that the conditional entropy flux and production rates, defined in Eq. (1), can be written in terms of the first and second cumulants as

\[
080601-3
\]
The stochastic entropy flux rates (light blue) for a sample of ten trajectories. The dark blue line is the ensemble average over all the trajectories. (b) The stochastic entropy production rates (light blue) and the ensemble average (dark blue), for the same sample of trajectories.

\[ \phi_{c,r} = \frac{\Gamma_m}{n_{th} + 1/2} \left[ (\bar{n}_{th} + 1/2) - \theta(t) \right] - 4 \Gamma_{qba} \theta(t), \]

\[ \pi_{c,r} = \Gamma_m \left[ \frac{\theta(t)}{n_{th} + 1/2} + \frac{V_{uc}}{V(t)} - 2 \right] + 4 \Gamma_{qba} [\theta(t) - \eta_{det} V(t)], \]

where \( \theta(t) = V(t) + r(t)^T r(t)/2 \) encompasses all the stochastic contributions [cf. Eq. (5)]. We can experimentally reconstruct such quantities by means of the measured stochastic trajectories \( r(t) \) and the inferred conditional variance \( V(t) \). We show in Fig. 2 some realizations of the stochastic entropy flux and production rates. Despite the low thermal occupancy of \( \bar{n}_{th} \approx 14 \) phonons, these quantities fluctuate substantially, highlighting the essential role of fluctuations in the thermodynamics of the system.

We also average them over 3600 trajectories, yielding the conditional flux and production rates \( \Phi_c = \mathbb{E}(\phi_{c,r}) \) and \( \Pi_c = \mathbb{E}(\pi_{c,r}) \), which are shown in Fig. 2, dark blue. These quantities can be readily computed from our model by noting that, owing to Eqs. (5) and (6) and our choice of initial conditions, we have \( \mathbb{E}[\theta(t)] = V_{uc} \). From Fig. 2 we gather that both \( \Phi_c \) and \( \Pi_c \) relax monotonically towards the new steady-state values. However, even at the steady state, the entropy production rate \( \Pi_c \) does not vanish due to the nonequilibrium nature of the stationary state, where the effects of the thermal bath, measurement backaction, and information gain compete with each other.

**Information gain.**—The influence that monitoring the system has on the irreversibility of the dynamics is encoded in the mismatch between the conditional entropy production rate \( \Pi_c \) and the unconditional one \( \Pi_{uc} \) [cf. Eq. (2)]. Such mismatch is quantified by the net rate of information gain achieved through measuring

\[ \dot{I} = \Gamma_m (V_{uc}/V(t) - 1) - 4 \eta_{det} \Gamma_{qba} V(t). \]

The temporal behavior of \( \dot{I} \) reconstructed from the experimental data is shown in Fig. 3. As in our case the system is prepared in the steady state of the unconditional dynamics, the first and second cumulants in the absence of monitoring remain constant in time, and the unconditional rate of entropy production keeps the value \( \Pi_{uc} = \Gamma_m [V_{uc}/(\bar{n}_{th} + 1/2) - 1] + 4 \Gamma_{qba} V_{uc} \) (cf. Ref. [37] for further details). We can thus subtract such value from \( \Pi_c \) in Fig. 2 to obtain the net rate of acquired information due to the continuous monitoring.

As the quantity \( - \int_0^\infty \dot{I} dt \) quantifies the mutual information between system and detector [30], and given that \( \dot{I} \) vanishes in the (conditional) steady state [cf. Fig. 3], such quantity tends to a constant in the long-time limit. This is intuitively understood from the fact that, in the steady state, monitoring the system does not add any additional information. If, however, the monitoring process suddenly stops, the conditional steady state will not be sustained and the system will heat-up back towards \( V_{uc} \). Constant monitoring is thus necessary to maintain the conditional steady state. In other words, even at the steady state, information is constantly being acquired, but noise is constantly being introduced by the phonon bath. It is thus interesting to
identify which of the terms in $\hat{I}$ is responsible for maintaining the incremental gains of information required to maintain the conditional steady state.

This concept can be readily understood from inspecting Eq. (9), which consists of the competition between the noise introduced by the phonon bath (at rate $\Gamma_m$) and the gain of information (proportional to the detection efficiency $\eta_{\text{det}}$). We can thus quite naturally introduce the differential gain $G(t) = -4\eta_{\text{det}}\Gamma_q V_{\text{ss}}(t)$ and notice that, in light of the interpretation of the last term in Eq. (6) as an innovation rate, $G(t)$ is the contribution of this innovation to $\hat{I}$. The behaviors of $\hat{I}$ and $G(t)$ inferred from the experimental data are shown in Fig. 3: the initial closeness of $G(t)$ to $\hat{I}$ suggests that the early stages of the dynamics are strongly affected by the differential information gain. As the dynamics approaches the steady state, however, the contribution from $G(t)$ becomes less significant. However, while $\hat{I} \to 0$, $G(t)$ tends to the (in general small) non-null value $G(\infty) = -4\eta_{\text{det}}\Gamma_q V_{\text{ss}}$, which thus represents the gain of information per unit time that the detector must acquire in order to maintain the steady state.

Conclusions.---We have investigated the effects of weak continuous measurements on the thermodynamics of a mesoscopic mechanical system. By employing a phase-space formalism [30] and the retrodictive techniques used in Ref. [31], we have connected pivotal thermodynamic investigator Programme (Grant No. 15/IA/2864), COST Action CA15220, the Royal Society Wolfson Research Fellowship (RSSF/R3/183013), the Royal Society International Exchanges Programme (IEC/R2/192220), the Leverhulme Trust Research Project Grant (Grant No. RGP-2018-266), the UK EPSRC.

*A*Corresponding author.
belenchia@qub.ac.uk


A. B. acknowledges hospitality at the Institute for Theoretical Physics and the “Non equilibrium quantum dynamics” group, Universität Stuttgart, where part of this work was carried out. We acknowledge financial support from the European Research Council project Q-CEOM (Grant No. 638765), Danish National Research Foundation (Center of Excellence Hy-Q), the EU H2020 FET proactive project HOT (Grant No. 732894), Fondazione Angelo Della Riccia, the São Paulo Research Foundation FAPESP (Grants No. 2017/50304-7, No. 2017/07973-5, and No. 2018/12813-0), the Brazilian CNPq (Grant No. INCT-IQ 246569/2014-0), the MSCA IF project pERFECtO (Grant No. 795782), the H2020-FETOPEN-2018-2020 project TEQ (Grant No. 766900), the DfE-SFI Investigator Programme (Grant No. 15/IA/2864), COST Action CA15220, the Royal Society Wolfson Research Fellowship (RSSF/R3/183013), the Royal Society International Exchanges Programme (IEC/R2/192220), the Leverhulme Trust Research Project Grant (Grant No. RGP-2018-266), the UK EPSRC.

